EVANSTON PUBLIC LIBRARY BOARD OF TRUSTEES

FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING PACKET

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 12, 2018

5:30 P.M.

BOARD ROOM – 4TH FLOOR
AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

2. CITIZEN COMMENT
   Not to exceed 15 minutes

3. NEW BUSINESS
   A. Main Weatherproofing Phase 4 (Action)

4. ADJOURNMENT

Next Regular Meeting: September 26, 2018 at 6:30 pm

The City of Evanston and the Evanston Public Library are committed to ensuring accessibility for all citizens. If an accommodation is needed to participate in this meeting, please contact the Library at 847-448-8650 48 hours in advance of the meeting so that arrangements can be made for the accommodation if possible.
Memorandum

To: Evanston Public Library Facilities Committee

From: Karen Danczak Lyons, Library Director
John Devaney, Facilities Manager

Subject: Approval of Main Library Weatherproofing – CIP Phase IV Bid 18-38

Date: August 27, 2018

Recommended Action:
Staff recommends the Evanston Public Library Facilities Committee authorize the Library Director to execute a contract for the Main Library Weatherproofing Project Phase IV with Reliable & Associates Construction Co. (4106 S. Emerald Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60609) in the amount of $538,800.00.

Funding Source:
Funding will be provided from Capital Improvements Fund 2018 GO Bonds (Account 187.48.4862.65515). This project was budgeted at $755,000 in FY 2018.

Bid 18-38 includes a project allowance of $75,000. Project allowances are funds that are in addition to the base bid amount in anticipation of unforeseen additional costs that may be uncovered during completion of a project. The $75,000 allowance is calculated by a customary 10% of a project's total budget.

Livability Benefits:

Background:
This proposal/scope includes masonry repairs, applying weatherproofing components to the South and West facades of the structure, power washing, replacing main entrance way doors/operating controls/hardware, storefront glazing and frames, replace/repair of concrete steps and walkways. Replace/repair of all components includes the furnishing of labor and materials to repair/restore masonry on the West and South building elevations, restoration of artwork and flagpole finishes.
In 2013, the comprehensive facility assessment report compiled by WJE architectural firm for the Main Library included recommendations for exterior weatherproofing. As a result of this assessment report, the first phase of the weatherproofing project was included in the 2016 Capital Improvement Budget, approved by the Library Board, and completed during 2016. Phase 1 included coping stone replacement/refurbishment at the roof level. Phases 2&3 performed in 2017 remedied the deterioration of the cast stone at the lower areas of the building as identified by CTL Group (EPL architects of record on the project), and restoration of the South and East facades. Phases 1, 2, &3 were completed by April Building Services (ABS). All three Phases were done well, were professionally managed in a safe manner, and came in under budget. In 2018, Phase 4 will continue the building envelope-weatherproofing project and will include West and South facades, building entryways and a number of ancillary construction items. Phase 4 is the final phase of the three-year project.

Analysis:
On July 19, 2018, COE/EPL issued bid documents for Bid 18-38. On August 03, 2018, eleven firms attended a pre-bid meeting for project details on Bid 18-38. On August 21, 2018, the COE Purchasing Department received and publicly read results of these six bids that were received back for the project. COE purchasing department, CTL Group (EPL’s architect of record), and Library staff reviewed all six bids. Of the six bids submitted, three (3) were eliminated due to high base bid pricing, and two (2) bids were considered non-responsive/non-responsible due to a number of factors.

Bid results were as follows:

AGAE Construction’s bid has been determined to be non-responsive as they failed to designate whether they did or did not have exceptions to the COE Contractor Services Agreement (contract), an incomplete Exhibit F form (LEP), and selected unable to comply with City’s LEP policy but was willing to work with the City. Labor costs also seemed low. Reference inquires did not return any positive results.

Continental Construction’s bid has been determined to be non-responsive as they failed to return COE Contractors Services Agreement. Signed off on Exhibit F (LEP compliance form) but the labor costs were deemed too low.

Continental Construction’s bid has been determined to be non-responsible for the following reasons:

1. Continental Construction has an established history of poor performance and unsuccessful projects with the City of Evanston. Examples include:
   a. Harley Clarke Coach House Renovations (2009). Work included tuckpointing, roofing repairs, gutters, and sidewalk. Continental Construction failed to pay their subcontractors in a timely manner resulting in the need for the City to issue joint checks to guarantee payments. Additionally, most likely as a result of Continental Construction failing to
pay subcontractors, the City never received project closeout documents or final lien waivers.

b. Water Plant Masonry Repairs (2009). Work included tuck-pointing for several buildings. Continental Construction damaged windows and doors at the high lift pumping station as a result of performing non-compliant acid washing of the brick exterior of this building. Continental declined to remedy the situation, so payment was withheld from their contract. Following this damage, the windows, and one door at this facility had to be replaced under separate contracts, and the withheld funds were applied to the replacement costs for these items.

c. Maple Avenue Parking Garage Repairs (2010). Work included façade repairs and removal of a portion of building’s fire suppression system. Due to Continental Construction’s lack of proper supervision, construction crews removed and discarded critical fire suppression system piping scheduled to remain resulting in the need to replace and reinstall this material on an emergency basis. Following the emergency reinstallation, Continental Construction failed to pay the fire protection company hired to replace the piping resulting in a lien against the property which required extensive work on the part of the City to resolve.

Reliable & Associates:

Recommended for bid award

Central Lakes Construction Co:

High base bid

All Chicago Inc:

High Base bid

Structures Construction Co:

High base bid

Summary:
Reliable & Associates Construction Co. is compliant with the City’s M/W/EBE goals and intends to comply with the City’s LEP requirements (see attached memo for more information). Staff contacted Reliable & Associates Construction Co. references, which indicate they have performed similar masonry renovation projects with satisfactory results. Staff has also worked with Reliable & Associates Construction Co. on other City of Evanston renovation projects with satisfactory results. Staff recommends that Reliable & Associates be awarded this work based on their positive references, prior performance, and lowest responsive and responsible bid for a total amount of $538,800.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bidder Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Base Bid</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGAE Contractors. Inc.</td>
<td>4549 N. Milwaukee Ave,</td>
<td>Non-responsive/Non-responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$470,839.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continental Const Co. Inc.</td>
<td>1919 Greenwood Ave, Evanston, IL 60201</td>
<td>Non-responsive/Non-responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$473,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliable &amp; Assoc Const Co.</td>
<td>4106 S. Emerald Ave, Chicago, IL 60609</td>
<td>$538,800.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Lakes Const Co.</td>
<td>749 Pinecrest, Prospect Heights, IL 60070</td>
<td>Non-responsive/Non-responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$623,282.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Chicago Inc.</td>
<td>4100 W. Belmont Ave, Chicago, IL 60641</td>
<td>Non-responsive/Non-responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$705,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structures Const Co. Inc.</td>
<td>2300 W. Diversey Ave, Chicago, IL 60647</td>
<td>Non-responsive/Non-responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$749,800.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As a result, staff recommends award of this project to Reliable & Associates Construction Company. A breakdown of the recommended bid award is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Bid 18-38</th>
<th>Reliable &amp; Associates Construction Company</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base Bid</td>
<td>$463,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction Allowance</td>
<td>$75,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$538,800</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Attachments:**
M/W/EBE Compliance Memo
CTL Group Memo
Reliable & Associates Construction Contract
September 6, 2018

Mr. John Devaney
Manager – Maintenance/Security
Evanston Public Library
1703 Orrington Ave.
Evanston, IL 60201

Phone: (847) 448-8622
Email: jdevaney@cityofevanston.org

Bid Evaluation for 2018 Main Library Weatherproofing Phase IV
Evanston Public Library – BID 18-38
CTLGroup Project No. 262906

Dear Mr. Devaney:

As requested, CTLGroup reviewed three bids for weatherproofing work described in the Evanston Public Library Main Library Phase 4 Weatherproofing 2018 documents prepared by CTLGroup and issued on June 29, 2018. This work is to be implemented at the Evanston Public Library located at 1703 Orrington Avenue in Evanston, Illinois. Copies of bids were received by CTLGroup on August 30, 2018 from the following bidders:

- AGAE Contractors, Inc. (AGAE)
- Continental Construction Company, Inc. (Continental)
- Reliable & Associates Construction Company (Reliable)

CTLGroup can recommend only Reliable based on previous experience working with them. CTLGroup has not worked with AGAE before and therefore cannot recommend them based on personal experience. CTLGroup has, however, worked with Continental but cannot recommend.

CTLGroup attended a post-bid meeting with you, Reliable and their concrete subcontractor. The paint subcontractor they would be working with on this job is someone we have worked with before and have had a positive working experience with. We believe Reliable understands the scope of work and that their approach to the Work is well thought out and suitable for the type of work being performed. Having reviewed their subcontractor’s estimates, they seem realistic based on our estimations. If Reliable is awarded the job, we believe the work will be thorough and accurate.

AGAE’s bid is incomplete and therefore may be considered non-responsive. The Exhibit F, Local Employment Program Compliance form is incomplete and they selected “unable to comply with the LEP requirements but am willing to work with the City to achieve compliance.” They also did not state whether they did or did not have exceptions to the Contractor Services Agreement. Additionally, their bid of $470,839.00 is inconsistent with our estimated construction cost. This disparity will most likely result in a number of change orders during construction.

Continental’s bid is also incomplete because they did not return the Contractor Services Agreement and, therefore, may be considered non-responsive. Their bid of $473,500.00 is also inconsistent with our estimated construction cost.
RECOMMENDATIONS

CTLGroup recommends Reliable based on our past experience with them, the complete bid package provided by them for the Work, and the fact that their bid is consistent with our estimations for this project. If the City elects to enter into a contract with AGAE or Continental, they should anticipate possible additional costs for the work in the form of change orders or possible legal issues as they try to negotiate a more favorable contract. Past experience with Continental required additional construction oversight.

If you have any questions, or if we can be of further assistance, please do not hesitate to call.

Very truly yours,
CTLGroup

[Signature]

David Cook, RA
Principal Architect
Architecture + Building Science
DCook@CTLGroup.com

Direct: (847) 972-3236
CTLGroup COA #184-001246

Elizabeth V. Rodenkirch, AIA, LEED AP BD+C
Architect III
Architecture + Building Science
ERodenkirch@CTLGroup.com

Direct: (847) 972-3324
Cell: (217) 898-1596